
Scrutiny Committee – Minutes

Meeting: Scrutiny Committee
Date: 24 January 2019
Venue: George Hudson Boardroom, City of York Council, 1st Floor, West Offices, Station Rise, York

Attendees:

Cllr Cathy Mitchell	Warrington (Chair)
Cllr Eric Firth	West Yorkshire (Vice-Chair)
Cllr Martin Mitchell	Blackpool
Cllr Matthew Salter	Lancashire
Cllr Jim Shorrocks	Blackburn with Darwen
Cllr Michael Mordey	North East
Cllr Philip Jackson	North East Lincolnshire
Cllr John Davison	North Lincolnshire
Cllr Paul Haslam*	North Yorkshire
Cllr Ann Reid	York

*Substitute Member in attendance

Officers

Iain Craven	Finance Director
Dawn Madin	Business Capabilities Director
Sasha Wayne	Head of Legal Services
Peter Molyneux	Major Roads Director
Owen Wilson	Major Roads Strategy Manager
Robin Miller-Stott	Senior Policy and Strategy Officer
Rosemary Lyon	Legal and Democratic Services Officer
Oyetona Raheem	Democratic Services Officer

Apologies

Cllr Don Stockton	Cheshire East
Cllr Sean Chaytor	Hull City Council
Cllr John McElroy	North East
Cllr Roy Miller	Sheffield City Region
Cllr David Southward	Cumbria
Cllr Andy Paraskos	North Yorkshire
Cllr Gordon Friel	Liverpool City Region
Cllr Carl Johnson	North of Tyne
Cllr Denise Lelliott	Sheffield City Region
Cllr Barry Collins	West Yorkshire
Cllr Peter Dew	York

1.0 Welcome and Apologies

- 1.1 The Chair noted the meeting would be delayed by about 10 minutes, allowing time for late arrivals.
- 1.2 Apologies for absence were noted.
- 1.3 It being noted that the quorum for the Committee was established in the Constitution rather than being a statutory requirement, the Chair moved that the quorum be waived to permit the meeting to commence. The Committee agreed the proposed waiver.

1.4 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

The clerk to request completed Declaration of Interest forms from the new Committee Members. **Action:** OR

2.0 Minutes

- 2.1 The Minutes of the meeting of the Transport for the North ("TfN") Scrutiny Committee held on 22 November 2018 were considered.

RESOLVED: *That the minutes of the meeting of the Transport for the North Scrutiny Committee held on 30 August 2018 be approved as a correct record.*

3.0 Constitution Review

- 3.1 Sasha Wayne (SW) presented the Constitution Review Report which was taken as read.
- 3.2 Cllr Salter sought clarification regarding provision in the constitution on meeting attendance via telephone / tele-conference. SW noted the matter had been mentioned as a possibility due to the wide geography of Transport for the North and Committee Members finding it challenging to travel to meetings. SW confirmed that Transport for the North recognise that tele conference was not appropriate for Transport for the North Board and Statutory Committee meetings and that the matter had been discussed with Legal Officers from all the component authorities.
- 3.3 Cllr Reid proposed that the current quorum of 10 members for the Committee should be reduced in the constitution. She also proposed an amendment to allow public speaking at Scrutiny Committees. Cllr Reid noted the decision in relation to public speaking at Transport for the North Board.

-
- 3.4 Cllr Haslam noted the provision in the constitution regarding the non-voting status of LEPs on the Transport for the North Board.
- 3.5 Cllr Davison proposed that attendance at meetings by video conferencing should be considered rather than by telephone. SW agreed to pick up the suggestion with the Officer leading on the review and ensure that reference to video conferencing is reflected in the report for the next Committee meeting. **Action:** SW
- 3.6 Cllr Salter queried if there were other avenues for members of the public to communicate with Transport for the North Board/Committee rather than through public speaking. SW gave explanations on how written deputations to the Chair and CEO were referred to relevant Transport for the North officers for a suitable response.

RESOLVED: *That the report and responses received to date in respect of the Review of the Transport for the North Constitution be noted.*

4.0 Strategic Development Corridors

- 4.1 Owen Wilson presented the SDC Update Report which was taken as read. Peter Molyneux (PM) then provided an update for Committee members regarding the letter received from Anne Robinson on 22 January. The letter from Anne Robinson was read out together with the reply sent by Transport for the North.
- 4.2 In answer to a question from Cllr Mordey, Owen Wilson (OW) responded that the work will commence in Autumn this year, subject to sign off of the business plan. The aim was to start further analysis work this year and work towards completion by Summer 2020. There was need to be sure that the identified model was working correctly.
- 4.3 Cllr Haslam commented positively on the comprehensive response to Anne Robinson's letter and welcomed Transport for the North's engagement with the National Parks. He noted that talking to local councillors should be rolled out across all schemes, not just the National Parks.

Cllr Haslam asked how close the plan would get against future forecast. OW replied that modelling had been based on transport demand in 2050. The demand figures used were based on government projections for growth in road traffic and a methodology for forecasting rail demand matching that used for the NPR business case. The next round of modelling will provide an opportunity to test different scenarios, including transformational economic growth in the North.

PM advised that there were four scenarios set out in the STP. It was about being proportionate and future modelling work will refresh to reflect changes in development, technology and behaviours.

RESOLVED: *To note the progress made, and the processes followed, to ensure that TfN had both adhered to best practice and fully engaged partners in decision making throughout the development of the Strategic Programme Outline Cases for each corridor.*

5.0 Strategic Transport Plan

- 5.1 Robin Miller-Stott (RMS) presented his report on the STP which was taken as read. Some of the key changes to the Final Strategic Transport Plan were highlighted, including specifically the significant work that had been done around sustainability, ensuring that Transport for the North was fully complying with statutory requirements for the Plan.
- 5.2 Cllr Salter referred to page 13 of the STP and sought more clarification on how Transport for the North was supporting partners in investment making at a local level. RMS drew attention to the Role and Remit section of the STP to explain how Transport for the North was working collaboratively and to serving as a complement to the work being done by the partners at local levels. As set out in the Local Transport Act, local transport plans will need to reflect the priorities of the Sub-National Transport Body in their statutory transport plans. It was envisaged that Transport for the North's work will provide added value to the crucial role in enhancing cycling, walking, bus, and local road investment.
- 5.3 Cllr Haslam suggested that the executive summary of the TfN Committee reports should include a reference in the main document to the relevant pages of the key items being discussed.

Cllr Haslam expressed concern at what appeared to be Transport for the North's focus on the movement of people and not as much focus on freight. RMS noted the three aims of the Plan as connecting people, business and moving goods. The work TfN had been doing will enhance freight and logistics. TfN advice to government was that freight should be adequately represented. TfN's Enhanced Freight and Logistics Analysis could be assessed on Transport for the North's website (<https://transportforthenorth.com/wp-content/uploads/Freight-Logistics-Enhanced-Analysis-Report.pdf>), and had been key throughout the development of the Strategic Development Corridors and Northern Powerhouse Rail.

OW noted that East/West rail connectivity for container traffic was non-existent in the North, so it was a priority to see more rail freight paths on the networks. There was reliance on private sector investment. The case was being made for public investment, but it was proving challenging to make that case. This was a work currently ongoing using the evidence available from the modelling in the freight report.

Cllr Haslam noted part of the report which identified that less people and freight were being moved in the North of England compared to the rest of the country. He expressed that this would not be the case if the facilities were accessible for the people.

- 5.4 Cllr Firth asked about the current development of Trans Pennine Route Upgrade and specifically the role of freight. RMS replied that Transport for the North had made very strong representation and advice to the DfT, and that freight should remain a key element of its development.
- 5.5 Cllr Reid was pleased to see the detailed assessment that had been done in the Carbon Review and that Officers have agreed to accept the comments from Mr Rae.

Cllr Reid asked if it was part of the remit of Transport for the North to monitor aircraft emissions. RMS said that the primary focus of Transport for the North was how people and goods were moved on the ground, ensuring that the transport network was ready to support demand from all economic assets, whether they be towns, cities, National Parks, ports, or airports. Transport for the North will play its part by working with the Government to achieve a reduction in carbon emissions by 2050. This will be scoped out in the 'Pathway to 2050'. The STP also stated that the Government and the aviation industry will be expected to reduce carbon emissions to align with Government targets.

- 5.6 Cllr Salter commented on page 13 of the report and noted that some of the planned developments will go through the rural areas. He wondered if adequate considerations have been paid to impact on young people on issues such as rural deprivation, isolation and mental health. RMS explained how the Plan aimed to support inclusive and sustainable economic transformation and growth across all parts of the North and not just the big cities. Transport investment will support different levels of transformation across the North. RMS also explained how Transport for the North had been working with all stakeholders in the development of the Plan to ensure that no part was left behind. Health benefits of improved transportation will be better reflected in the Plan, with joint working with Public Health England. The STP also called for high levels of

mitigation, and the inclusion of green, blue and grey infrastructure when the interventions in the Investment Programme were delivered.

- 5.7 OW gave explanations on report of environmental impact that have been provided for each of the corridors. A more detailed appraisal which recognised all the assets will provide further information on where benefits will be spread.

Iain Craven (IC) noted that spread of investment was something that Transport for the North Board Members have raised. The funding framework adopted by Transport for the North addressed the issue of sustainable economic growth. Also, next year business plan will include an assurance framework, setting out how decisions will be made and how Transport for the North will prioritise.

- 5.8 Cllr Mordey asked if there had been analysis of the impact of Brexit on the economy and on the STP. RMS replied that the Plan was of a long-term nature and built on independent economic review which had been published. The review had highlighted the under investment in infrastructure and lack of skills. There would be a refresh of economic review and further talks held with stakeholders to ensure that there were evidence-led decisions.

- 5.9 Cllr Haslam noted on page 8 of the STP, consultation plan and responses which contained a very good description of what Transport for the North was set out to achieve and requested all to note that we will be held accountable for these words.

Cllr Haslam asked if Transport for the North had looked at how to improve on Webtag. RMS gave explanations on how modelling will take account of wider benefits; something the Inclusive and Sustainable Growth Framework will scope out this year, including a Sustainable Return on Investment, to ensure that in business cases all the wider benefits were captured. This also picked up recent Green Book guidance from HM Treasury.

RESOLVED: *To recommend to the Transport for the North Board that the final STP be approved for adoption as the Statutory plan and to be published as formal advice to the Government.*

***The Committee adjourned for a break at 12:30 and resumed at 13:00.
Cllr P Haslam left at 13:00.***

6.0 Business Plan 2019/20

- 6.1 IC talked the Committee through the presentation slides.

-
- 6.2 IC noted that Cllr Haslam had raised separately that the introductory section to the Business Plan should make reference to sustainability.

RESOLVED: *That the report be noted by the Committee*

7.0 Budget 2019/20

- 7.1 IC talked the Committee through the presentation slides.
- 7.2 Cllr Salter queried the premise on which Transport for the North had arrived at £2m for a minimum reserve level. IC explained that it balanced the requirement for Transport for the North to manage its cash flows in the context of separate funding streams, whilst not withholding excessive funds that could otherwise be spent on Transport for the North activity. IC also noted that the reserves figure of £2m should be viewed in the context of Transport for the North's overall budget of £105m for 2019/20.
- 7.3 Cllr Davison asked if there would be updated Gant charts to adequately reflect milestones and effect on reserves. IC agreed that Transport for the North could provide the Executive Reports on programmes and risk in the future which provides more clarity in this regard.

Executive Reports on programmes and risk to be added to the agenda for a future Scrutiny Committee. **Action:** IC

RESOLVED: *That the report be noted by the Committee*

8.0 Treasury Management Policy

- 8.1 IC presented the report which was taken as read. He explained that the policy was designed to support Transport for the North's approach to cash management risk.

RESOLVED: *To note the Treasury Management Policy for 2019/20.*