

Shadow Scrutiny Committee Meeting – Minutes

Meeting: Shadow Scrutiny Committee Meeting
Date: 22 May 2018, 2.00pm – 4.00pm
Venue: Mallard Suite, TfN, 4 Piccadilly Place, Manchester, M1 3BN

Attendees:

Sasha Wayne (Chair)	Head of Legal, Transport for the North
Cllr Philip Jackson	N.E. Lincolnshire Council
Cllr Andy Paraskos	North Yorkshire
Cllr Eric Firth	West Yorkshire
Cllr Nick Wallis	Tees Valley Combined Authority
Cllr Haroldo Herrera-Richmond	Hull City Council
Cllr Cathy Mitchell	Warrington Borough Council
Cllr Sean Chaytor	Hull City Council
Cllr Martin Mitchell	Blackpool Council
Cllr Harold Davenport	Cheshire East
Cllr Ann Reid	York
Cllr Gordon Friel	Liverpool City Region

Also in Attendance:

Deborah Dimock	Solicitor
Dawn Madin	Director of HR and Mobilisation
David Abdy	Portfolio Director

Apologies:

Cllr Andy Burton	East Riding of Yorkshire
Cllr Bruce Pickard	North East
Cllr Roy Miller	Sheffield City Region
Cllr Ian Stewart	Cumbria

1.0	Welcome and Apologies (v)	Action
1.1	Colleagues were welcomed to the meeting.	
1.2	Apologies for absence were noted.	
1.3	All in attendance noted their desire to hold a 1 minute's silence at 2:30pm to honour the victims of the Manchester Arena attack one year earlier.	

2.0 An Introduction to TfN (r)

- 2.1 Transport for the North (TfN) provided a report detailing the rationale, background to, and purpose of TfN. A verbal summary of the report was provided by Deborah Dimock, TfN.
- 2.2 TfN is a pan-Northern statutory body established to provide a single voice for the North of England. It has been established as a joint public-private body, sponsored by the Department for Transport (DfT) with a role to identify and establish infrastructure investment for interconnected, multimodal transport links to promote economic growth and opportunities for the public and business alike.
- 2.3 The statutory role of TfN was explained in further detail, with TfN having a statutory duty to adopt a Strategic Transport Plan and to advise the Secretary of State (SoS) on matters relating to Northern Transport. In addition, TfN has powers over the contracting of road infrastructure, and powers to enter into ticketing schemes through the Integrated Smart Travel programme (IST).

3.0 An Introduction to the TfN Constitution (r)

- 3.1 Deborah Dimock provided a summary of the report outlining the Constitution. It was noted that the constitution is based on the Regulations establishing TfN and contains all rules of procedure TfN is to abide by, as well as all governance arrangements for TfN. Attendees were asked to note that the Constitution had been through consultation with 56 constituent bodies, and had been approved at the TfN Board meeting held on 05 April 2018.
- 3.2 TfN Board was noted as having the power to Co-Opt members, and had done so in relation to the all the members of the Partnership Board, the 11 representatives of the Local Enterprise Partnerships, HS2, Highways England and Network Rail.

The following authorities were also entitled under the Regulations to appoint co-opted Members even though they are outside the TfN area:

- A. Lincolnshire County Council
- B. Nottingham City Council
- C. Nottinghamshire Council
- D. Staffordshire County Council
- E. Derbyshire County Council
- F. Stoke City Council

These authorities were entitled to be co-opted due to their involvement in Rail North Ltd, and would retain voting rights on matters relating to Franchise Management of the Northern and Transpennine Franchise routes, but would not have voting rights on any other matters. The other co-opted members would have no voting rights.

- 3.3 On the topic of Rail North, attendees were asked to note that Rail North Limited would be folded into TfN as a whole, with all assets and responsibilities taken on by TfN. The Rail North Partnership would remain as a body operated by TfN, but jointly overseen by TfN and DfT.
- 3.4 Attendees were asked to note that TfN would not be adopting its own Code of Conduct for members. Matters relating to breaches of conduct would be referred to the relevant appointing authority/organisation.
- 3.5 Cllr Eric Firth, West Yorkshire, queried the nature of the Scrutiny Committee re: public involvement. Deborah Dimock clarified that public access and observation would be allowed, however public participation would not be allowed, unless invited by the committee itself, e.g. as a witness statement, advanced question submission, etc.
- 3.6 A minute's silence was observed by all attendees as agreed in item 1.3 of the minutes.

RESOLVED: That the committee note the governance arrangements, voting rights, and regulations contained within the Constitution of TfN.

4.0 The Role of Scrutiny in TfN (r)

- 4.1 Sasha Wayne provided a summary of the report outlining the TfN Scrutiny Committee Terms of

Reference. The meeting was informed that the TfN Board had formally agreed that the Scrutiny Committee would act as a pre-Scrutiny body in order to meaningfully shape decision making, and would not have post-Scrutiny oversight or power to call in.

- 4.2 Cllr Sean Chaytor, Hull, raised the concern that due to the timing of the first Scrutiny Committee falling on 14 June, followed by TfN Board on 28 June, the opportunity to adequately scrutinise may not be available, and asked if alternative solutions might be available.
- 4.3 David Abdy, TfN, assured the meeting that in this instance, no 'top ten' decisions would be going before the Board in June, and that the September meeting would be the defining meeting of the 2018-19 year.
- 4.4 Cllr Martin Michell, Blackpool, queried the scheduled timing of meetings against TfN Board dates, specifically the time allotted to Scrutiny Committee to adequately scrutinise proposals submitted to Board.
Cllr Chaytor added to the concern raised by pointing out the 5 clear days rule applied to papers, further reducing time.
- 4.5 David Abdy addressed these concerns by explaining that multiple documents are submitted to TfN Board over the course of the year in the pursuit of decisions; meaning that Scrutiny Committee will rarely be in the position where documentation relating to a matter for decision is a 'one off' as opposed to part of a wider overview of ongoing work.
- 4.6 Cllr Anne Reid queried if Scrutiny Committee had the power to invite representatives of co-opted members e.g. Nottinghamshire, to provide evidence.
Deborah Dimock confirmed that this power was available to the Committee.
- 4.7 Cllr Philip Jackson, North East Lincolnshire, queried if limitations were set on Scrutiny Committee in its agenda by TfN Board.

Sasha Wayne explained that the scope of focus was for Scrutiny Committee to define for itself, and was not directed by TfN officers .

- 4.8 Cllr's Eric Firth and Sean Chaytor queried workload and the committee ability to split into sub groups.
Cllr's Gordon Friel, and Nick Wallis, Teeside, cautioned against overuse of delegation or subgroups for concern over compromising the pan-Northern approach of TfN.
- 4.9 Sasha Wayne confirmed that the nature in which Scrutiny Committee wishes to perform its work is at its own discretion, allowing for sub-groups if so desired.

RESOLVED: That the committee note the Terms of Reference for the Scrutiny Committee and the scrutiny first approach.

5.0 TfN Programmes Update (p)

- 5.1 David Abdy provided a presentation detailing the economic impetus for TfN, the reasoning behind the Strategic Transport Plan (STP), and brief explanations of the following programmes:
- Northern Powerhouse Rail (NPR)
 - IST (Integrated Smart Travel)
 - Major Roads Network (MRN)
 - Strategic Corridor Studies
 - Strategic Rail
- 5.2 In relation to the tranche 1 of the IST programme, re: deployment of smart ticketing machines across Northern Railway stations, Cllr Eric Firth queried if touch points would be available on trains to avoid instances of incorrect fining of pre-paid passengers. DA
David Abdy stated that plans do exist for this, however he will provide more detail for the committee.
- 5.3 Cllr Martin Mitchell asked why a guarantee on 100% lowest fare calculation was not provided by TfN to IST users.
David Abdy addressed this issue by explaining the system will never be 100% accurate due to

shifting data provided by operators, but that close to 100% will be achieved.

- 5.4 Cllr Gordon Friel stated that it would be remiss of attendees not to use the opportunity to raise the recent travel disruptions experienced by the public due to the timetable changes implemented on 21 May 2018, and performance of the Northern franchise, as highlighted by Mayor Andy Burnham on 16 May 2018. Specifically, if an enquiry would go ahead, and what lessons would be learned from the experience. This was echoed by various attendees. David Abdy committed to feeding this back to the Strategic Rail Director, David Hoggarth. DA
- 5.5 David Abdy informed the meeting that TfN Board would be asked to consider the focus/purpose of TfN over the next 5 years, once the STP had been approved.
- 5.6 Cllr Nick Wallis asked for a glossary of anacronyms for the committee, and advised that officers attempt to use plain English during the public meetings for accessibility reasons. David Abdy committed to providing the glossary to members. DA
- 5.7 Funding risks and their impact on TfN programmes was raised as a topic of concern. David Abdy explained that a 'cherry picking' approach was not being provided to DfT and partners such as Highways England and Network Rail, but singular transformational options that seek to achieve the same interconnectivity. In terms of finance, Cllr Gordon Friel pointed out that to rebalance funding from the South would require a strong evidence base and singular voice from TfN and its constituent authorities.

6.0 Appointment of Chair and Vice Chair (v)

- 6.1 Sasha Wayne provided a summary of the report regarding the appointment of Chair and Vice Chair for the Scrutiny Committee. Sasha Wayne explained that it had been decided by TfN Board that the Chair of the Committee would be elected by its Members, and that two Vice Chairs would be elected, one from the main political party of the North (currently Labour) and the other from

- of the major minority party (e.g. currently Conservative).
- 6.2 Due to time constraints attendees asked that an immediate vote be held, with Cllr Cathy Mitchell elected as Chair, Cllr Eric Firth as majority Vice Chair, and Cllr Andy Parabas as Minority Vice Chair.
- 6.3 This was noted for the minutes, however Sasha Wayne informed the meeting that the appointments would need to be made at the formal Committee Meeting so a report recommending the appointments will be prepared for the first Scrutiny Committee meeting on the 14 June seeking a resolution from the Committee on the appointment of Chair and 2 Vice Chairs. SW

RESOLVED: That the committee note the requirements for a Chair and 2 Vice Chairs and that a report setting out the nominations will be brought to the first Scrutiny Committee meeting on 14 June.

7.0 Agenda for the first Scrutiny Committee and Practical Arrangements for future Committee Meetings

- 7.1 Sasha Wayne provided a summary of the report outlining the scrutiny future work programme. Sasha Wayne explained that TfN was seeking to hold Scrutiny Committee meetings across the North, however this was at the discretion of Scrutiny Committee. Additionally, it was requested that members assist in providing publicly accessible facilities/venues and do so by submitting options to Sasha via email for consideration at the 14 June meeting. All Members
- 7.2 Sasha Wayne also confirmed that minutes and papers would be made publicly available on the TfN website, and that it was hoped that the meeting room facilities will allow for webcasting of committee meetings.
- 7.3 Sasha Wayne explained that it was currently proposed that the inaugural meeting on 14 June would have an agenda item dedicated to the STP with more in-depth views of workstreams within each programme area, if the committee agreed. SW

Upon request, it was agreed that a member of IST would attend to provide additional information and answer questions at said meeting.

- 7.4 With regard to timings and lunch, it was agreed that flexibility would be possible on length of time, but that two hours was preferred by members. Dawn Madin committed to providing an answer on the issue of lunch for members at lunchtime meetings. DM

RESOLVED: That the first item for committee shall be a report of the STP consultation and proposed amendments to the plan together with IST with a particular focus on matters coming to TfN Board in June (tranche.1 pilot and tranche.2 procurement).

r = report; p = presentation; v = verbal